

# Homework exercise: MHD dynamos

Matthias Rempel (HAO/NCAR)

July 20, 2011

## 1 Turbulent induction effects

The purpose of this problem set is to derive expressions for the mean field electromotive force  $\overline{\mathcal{E}}$  under strongly simplifying assumptions. We start with a few problems in tensor algebra to recall a few mathematical skills useful for the following exercises.

### 1.1 Tensor algebra

For the following mathematical derivations it will be useful to use a component based notation for the manipulation of vector/tensor expressions. A term like  $(\mathbf{A} \cdot \nabla)\mathbf{B}$  can be expressed as  $A_k \partial B_i / \partial x_k$ , where we use the “summation convention”, which assumes that the duplication of the index “k” implies summation  $k = 1, 2, 3$ . Using the total antisymmetric Levi-Civita tensor  $\varepsilon_{ijk}$  we can express a cross product  $\mathbf{A} \times \mathbf{B} = \mathbf{C}$  as  $C_i = \varepsilon_{ijk} A_j B_k$ . Note that  $\varepsilon_{ijk}$  is +1 for even perturbations of (1,2,3), -1 for odd perturbations of (1,2,3) and 0 otherwise. A useful relation for expressions including products of the Levi-Civita tensor is the identity (“contracted epsilon identity”)

$$\varepsilon_{ijk} \varepsilon_{ilm} = \delta_{jl} \delta_{km} - \delta_{jm} \delta_{kl} \quad (1)$$

with the Kronecker symbol  $\delta_{ik}$ , which is 1 for  $i = j$  and 0 otherwise.

#### Problems:

- a) Compute the double contraction  $\varepsilon_{ijk} \varepsilon_{ijl}$ .
- b) Proof the vector identity

$$\nabla \times (\mathbf{A} \times \mathbf{B}) = -(\mathbf{A} \cdot \nabla)\mathbf{B} + \mathbf{A}\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B} + (\mathbf{B} \cdot \nabla)\mathbf{A} - \mathbf{B}\nabla \cdot \mathbf{A}. \quad (2)$$

- c) Let  $a_{ij} = -\varepsilon_{ijk} \gamma_k$  be an antisymmetric tensor. Derive an expression for  $\gamma$ .

## 1.2 Second order correlation approximation

### Problems:

- a) Start from the induction equation for  $\mathbf{B}'$  (Volume I, Eq. 3.44):

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{B}'}{\partial t} = \nabla \times (\mathbf{v}' \times \overline{\mathbf{B}} + \overline{\mathbf{v}} \times \mathbf{B}' - \eta \nabla \times \mathbf{B}' + \mathbf{v}' \times \mathbf{B}' - \overline{\mathbf{v}' \times \mathbf{B}'}) , \quad (3)$$

and assume  $\overline{\mathbf{v}} = 0$ ,  $|\mathbf{B}'| \ll |\overline{\mathbf{B}}|$  and neglect the contribution from magnetic resistivity. Formally integrate the equation to obtain a solution for  $\mathbf{B}'$  and derive an expression for  $\mathcal{E} = \overline{\mathbf{v}' \times \mathbf{B}'}$ . Assume that  $\mathbf{v}'$  has a finite correlation time,  $\tau_c$ , and simplify expressions by approximating time integrals with  $\int_{-\infty}^t \overline{v'_i(t)v'_k(s)} ds = \tau_c \overline{v'_i(t)v'_k(t)}$ .

- b) Express now all terms using the component notation summarized in Sect. 1.1 and show that the tensors  $a_{ij}$  and  $b_{ijk}$  in the expansion  $\mathcal{E}_i = a_{ij}\overline{B}_j + b_{ijk}\partial\overline{B}_j/\partial x_k$  are given by:

$$a_{ij} = \tau_c \overline{\left( \varepsilon_{ikl} v'_k \frac{\partial v'_l}{\partial x_j} - \varepsilon_{ikj} v'_k \frac{\partial v'_m}{\partial x_m} \right)} \quad (4)$$

$$b_{ijk} = \tau_c \varepsilon_{ijm} \overline{v'_m v'_k} . \quad (5)$$

- c) Decompose these tensors into the terms  $\alpha$ ,  $\gamma$  and  $\beta$  defined through:

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha_{ij} &= \frac{1}{2} (a_{ij} + a_{ji}) \\ \gamma_i &= -\frac{1}{2} \varepsilon_{ijk} a_{jk} \\ \beta_{ij} &= \frac{1}{4} (\varepsilon_{ikl} b_{jkl} + \varepsilon_{jkl} b_{ikl}) . \end{aligned}$$

Compute the trace  $\alpha_{ii}$  and  $\beta_{ii}$ . To which physical quantities are they related?

- d) Make now the additional assumption of isotropy, which implies that  $\alpha_{ij}$ ,  $\beta_{ij}$ , as well as the correlation tensor  $\overline{v'_i v'_j}$  are diagonal, i.e.  $\alpha_{ij} = \alpha \delta_{ij}$ . Compute the scalar  $\alpha$ -effect and the turbulent diffusivity  $\eta_t$ . How is  $\gamma$  related to  $\eta_t$ ? Discuss under which conditions these effects exist.

## 2 “Bierman battery”

The MHD induction equation is linear in  $\mathbf{B}$ , which implies that a dynamo cannot produce magnetic field if the initial condition was  $\mathbf{B} = 0$ . Start from the more general form of Ohm’s law and keep the electron pressure term. Rederive the induction equation and discuss under which conditions the additional term can act as an inhomogeneous source term independent of  $\mathbf{B}$ . Discuss the similarity with the vorticity equation. Describe situations in which this term could have produced weak magnetic seed field in the early universe.

# Problem set solutions: MHD dynamos

July 27, 2011

## 1 Tensor algebra

- a) Compute the double contraction  $\varepsilon_{ijk}\varepsilon_{ijl}$ .

**Solution:** Using  $\varepsilon_{ijk}\varepsilon_{ilm} = \delta_{jl}\delta_{km} - \delta_{jm}\delta_{kl}$  leads too:  
 $\varepsilon_{ijk}\varepsilon_{ijl} = \delta_{jj}\delta_{kl} - \delta_{jl}\delta_{kj} = 3\delta_{kl} - \delta_{kl} = 2\delta_{kl}$ .

- b) Proof the vector identity

$$\nabla \times (\mathbf{A} \times \mathbf{B}) = -(\mathbf{A} \cdot \nabla)\mathbf{B} + \mathbf{A}\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B} + (\mathbf{B} \cdot \nabla)\mathbf{A} - \mathbf{B}\nabla \cdot \mathbf{A}$$

**Solution:** Compute  $i^{th}$  component of expression:

$$\begin{aligned} [\nabla \times (\mathbf{A} \times \mathbf{B})]_i &= \varepsilon_{ijk} \frac{\partial}{\partial x_j} (\varepsilon_{klm} A_l B_m) \\ &= \varepsilon_{kij} \varepsilon_{klm} \left( \frac{\partial A_l}{\partial x_j} B_m + A_l \frac{\partial B_m}{\partial x_j} \right) \\ &= (\delta_{il}\delta_{jm} - \delta_{im}\delta_{jl}) \left( \frac{\partial A_l}{\partial x_j} B_m + A_l \frac{\partial B_m}{\partial x_j} \right) \\ &= B_m \frac{\partial A_i}{\partial x_m} + A_i \frac{\partial B_m}{\partial x_m} - B_i \frac{\partial A_l}{\partial x_l} - A_l \frac{\partial B_i}{\partial x_l} \\ &= (\mathbf{B} \cdot \nabla)A_i + A_i \nabla \cdot \mathbf{B} - B_i \nabla \cdot \mathbf{A} - (\mathbf{A} \cdot \nabla)B_i \end{aligned}$$

- c) Let  $a_{ij} = -\varepsilon_{ijk}\gamma_k$  be an antisymmetric tensor. Derive an expression for  $\gamma$ .

**Solution:** Contract  $a_{ij} = -\varepsilon_{ijk}\gamma_k$  with  $-\frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_{lij}$ :

$$-\frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_{lij}a_{ij} = \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_{lij}\varepsilon_{ijk}\gamma_k = \frac{1}{2}\underbrace{\varepsilon_{ijl}\varepsilon_{ijk}}_{2\delta_{lk}}\gamma_k = \gamma_l$$

## 2 Second order correlation approximation

a) Start from the induction equation for  $\mathbf{B}'$  (Volume I, Eq. 3.44):

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{B}'}{\partial t} = \nabla \times (\mathbf{v}' \times \overline{\mathbf{B}} + \overline{\mathbf{v}} \times \mathbf{B}' - \eta \nabla \times \mathbf{B}' + \mathbf{v}' \times \mathbf{B}' - \overline{\mathbf{v}' \times \mathbf{B}'}) , \quad (1)$$

and assume  $\overline{\mathbf{v}} = 0$ ,  $|\mathbf{B}'| \ll |\overline{\mathbf{B}}|$  and neglect the contribution from magnetic resistivity. Formally integrate the equation to obtain a solution for  $\mathbf{B}'$  and derive an expression for  $\overline{\mathcal{E}} = \overline{\mathbf{v}' \times \mathbf{B}'}$ . Assume that  $\mathbf{v}'$  has a finite correlation time,  $\tau_c$ , and simplify expressions by approximating time integrals with  $\int_{-\infty}^t \overline{v'_i(t)v'_k(s)} ds = \tau_c \overline{v'_i(t)v'_k(t)}$ .

**Solution:**

The simplified induction equation reads:

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{B}'}{\partial t} = \nabla \times (\mathbf{v}' \times \overline{\mathbf{B}}) ,$$

The formal solution for  $\mathbf{B}'$  is:

$$\mathbf{B}'(t) = \int_{-\infty}^t \nabla \times (\mathbf{v}'(s) \times \overline{\mathbf{B}}(s)) ds .$$

The resulting emf reads:

$$\begin{aligned} \overline{\mathcal{E}} &= \int_{-\infty}^t \overline{v'(t) \times \nabla \times (\mathbf{v}'(s) \times \overline{\mathbf{B}}(s))} ds \approx \tau_c \overline{v' \times \nabla \times (\mathbf{v}' \times \overline{\mathbf{B}})} \\ &= \tau_c v' \times [(\overline{\mathbf{B}} \cdot \nabla) \mathbf{v}' - \overline{\mathbf{B}} \nabla \cdot \mathbf{v}' - (\mathbf{v}' \cdot \nabla) \overline{\mathbf{B}}] \end{aligned}$$

b) Express now all terms using the component notation summarized and show that the tensors  $a_{ij}$  and  $b_{ijk}$  in the expansion  $\overline{\mathcal{E}}_i = a_{ij} \overline{B}_j + b_{ijk} \overline{\partial B}_j / \partial x_k$  are given by:

$$a_{ij} = \tau_c \left( \overline{\varepsilon_{ikl} v'_k \frac{\partial v'_l}{\partial x_j} - \varepsilon_{ikj} v'_k \frac{\partial v'_m}{\partial x_m}} \right) \quad (2)$$

$$b_{ijk} = \tau_c \overline{\varepsilon_{ijm} v'_m v'_k} . \quad (3)$$

**Solution:**

$$\begin{aligned} \overline{\mathcal{E}}_i &= \tau_c \left\{ \overline{\varepsilon_{ikl} v'_k \left( \overline{B}_j \frac{\partial v'_l}{\partial x_j} - \overline{B}_l \frac{\partial v'_m}{\partial x_m} \right) - \varepsilon_{imj} v'_m v'_k \frac{\partial \overline{B}_j}{\partial x_k}} \right\} \\ &= \tau_c \underbrace{\left( \overline{\varepsilon_{ikl} v'_k \frac{\partial v'_l}{\partial x_j} - \varepsilon_{ikj} v'_k \frac{\partial v'_m}{\partial x_m}} \right)}_{a_{ij}} \overline{B}_j + \underbrace{\tau_c \overline{\varepsilon_{ijm} v'_m v'_k}}_{b_{ijk}} \frac{\partial \overline{B}_j}{\partial x_k} \end{aligned}$$

c) Decompose these tensors into the terms  $\alpha$ ,  $\gamma$  and  $\beta$  defined through:

$$\begin{aligned}\alpha_{ij} &= \frac{1}{2}(a_{ij} + a_{ji}) \\ \gamma_i &= -\frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_{ijk}a_{jk} \\ \beta_{ij} &= \frac{1}{4}(\varepsilon_{ikl}b_{jkl} + \varepsilon_{jkl}b_{ikl}) .\end{aligned}$$

Compute the trace  $\alpha_{ii}$  and  $\beta_{ii}$ . To which physical quantities are they related?

**Solution:**

$$a_{ij} = \tau_c \overline{\left( \varepsilon_{ikl} v'_k \frac{\partial v'_l}{\partial x_j} - \varepsilon_{ikj} v'_k \frac{\partial v'_m}{\partial x_m} \right)}$$

Since the second term is antisymmetric in i and j it does not contribute to  $\alpha_{ij}$ . Thus we have:

$$\begin{aligned}\alpha_{ij} &= \frac{1}{2} \tau_c \overline{\left( \varepsilon_{ikl} v'_k \frac{\partial v'_l}{\partial x_j} + \varepsilon_{jkl} v'_k \frac{\partial v'_l}{\partial x_i} \right)} \\ \alpha_{ii} &= \tau_c \overline{\varepsilon_{ikl} v'_k \frac{\partial v'_l}{\partial x_i}} = -\tau_c \overline{v'_k \varepsilon_{kil} \frac{\partial v'_l}{\partial x_i}} = -\tau_c \overline{\mathbf{v}' \cdot \nabla \times \mathbf{v}'}\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}\gamma_n &= -\frac{1}{2} \varepsilon_{nij} a_{ij} = -\frac{1}{2} \tau_c \overline{\left( \varepsilon_{nij} \varepsilon_{ikl} v'_k \frac{\partial v'_l}{\partial x_j} - \varepsilon_{nij} \varepsilon_{ikj} v'_k \frac{\partial v'_m}{\partial x_m} \right)} \\ &= -\frac{1}{2} \tau_c \overline{\left( \underbrace{\varepsilon_{ijn} \varepsilon_{ikl}}_{\delta_{jk} \delta_{nl} - \delta_{jl} \delta_{nk}} v'_k \frac{\partial v'_l}{\partial x_j} + \underbrace{\varepsilon_{nij} \varepsilon_{kij}}_{2\delta_{kn}} v'_k \frac{\partial v'_m}{\partial x_m} \right)} \\ &= -\frac{1}{2} \tau_c \overline{\left( v'_k \frac{\partial v'_n}{\partial x_k} - v'_n \frac{\partial v'_j}{\partial x_j} + 2v'_n \frac{\partial v'_j}{\partial x_j} \right)} \\ &= -\frac{1}{2} \tau_c \frac{\partial}{\partial x_m} \overline{v'_n v'_m}\end{aligned}$$

With  $b_{ijk} = \tau_c \varepsilon_{ijm} \overline{v'_m v'_k}$  we get:

$$\begin{aligned}\beta_{ij} &= \frac{1}{4} (\varepsilon_{ikl} b_{jkl} + \varepsilon_{jkl} b_{ikl}) = \frac{1}{4} \tau_c (\varepsilon_{ikl} \varepsilon_{jkm} + \varepsilon_{jkl} \varepsilon_{ikm}) \overline{v'_m v'_l} \\ &= \frac{1}{2} \tau_c \varepsilon_{ikl} \varepsilon_{jkm} \overline{v'_m v'_l} = \frac{1}{2} \tau_c (\delta_{ij} \delta_{lm} - \delta_{im} \delta_{jl}) \overline{v'_m v'_l} \\ &= \frac{1}{2} \tau_c (\delta_{ij} \overline{v'^2} - \overline{v'_i v'_j}) \\ \beta_{ii} &= \tau_c \overline{v'^2}\end{aligned}$$

$\alpha_{ii}$  is proportional to the negative kinetic helicity of the flow,  $\beta_{ii}$  is proportional to the turbulent rms velocity squared.  $\gamma$  can be expressed as the divergence of the velocity correlation tensor.

- d) Make now the additional assumption of isotropy, which implies that  $\alpha_{ij}$ ,  $\beta_{ij}$ , as well as the correlation tensor  $\overline{v'_i v'_j}$  are diagonal, i.e.  $\alpha_{ij} = \alpha \delta_{ij}$ . Compute the scalar  $\alpha$ -effect and the turbulent diffusivity  $\eta_t$ . How is  $\gamma$  related to  $\eta_t$ ? Discuss under which conditions these effects exist.

**Solution:**

Isotropy implies:

$$\begin{aligned}\alpha &= \frac{1}{3}\alpha_{ii} = -\frac{1}{3}\tau_c \overline{\mathbf{v}' \cdot \nabla \times \mathbf{v}'} \\ \eta_t &= \frac{1}{3}\beta_{ii} = \frac{1}{3}\tau_c \overline{v'^2} \\ \gamma_i &= -\frac{1}{2}\tau_c \frac{\partial}{\partial x_m} \overline{v'_i v'_m} = -\frac{1}{2}\tau_c \frac{\partial}{\partial x_m} \left( \frac{1}{3} \overline{v'^2} \delta_{im} \right) \\ &= -\frac{1}{6}\tau_c \frac{\partial}{\partial x_i} \overline{v'^2} = -\frac{1}{2} \frac{\partial}{\partial x_i} \eta_t\end{aligned}$$

Note that the last step is only valid if  $\tau_c$  does not vary spatially. Although this effect is very often expressed as gradient of  $\eta_t$ , this is not the case for highly stratified convection such as the solar convection zone. Since  $v'^2$  is increasing monotonically from the base of the CZ toward the photosphere, the resulting  $\gamma$  describes a downward transport throughout the entire CZ “turbulent pumping”.

$\eta_t$  is present under minimal assumptions (e.g. isotropy, homogeneity) since it is simply related to the turbulence intensity.  $\gamma$  requires in addition inhomogeneity (e.g. stratification). For  $\alpha$  reflectional symmetry needs to be broken, e.g. through a combination of stratification and rotation.